to be awarded in August, 1987. The work would commence shortly thereafter.

The combined allocation for the three projetcs for 1987-88 is Rs. 129.64 crores.

---

12 NOON

NOTICE OF BREACH OF PRIVILEGE AGAINST PRIME MINISTER

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let us take up the Business. Yes, Secretary General.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH (West Bengal): What about our notice?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You are not ready to lisent to me. (*Interruptions*), You want to know the reasons. I will give you the reasons. Please sit down. (*Interruptions*). Now be quiet please. I request you to listen to me. (*Interruptions*). The earlier ruling has already been given.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: I could not hear the earlier ruling because of the unruly scenes created by the Treasury Benches. You please tell us now. (*Interruptions*). I made a submission to which you gave a ruling but because of the unruly scenes created by the Treasury Benches I could not hear your ruling.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY (Karnataka). Since the Question Hour is over, may I request you to take up the Privilege Motion for consideration now? (*Interruptions*). We have to discuss this Privilege Motion now. Please allow us to participate in the debate. (*Interruptions*). We do not want any other matter to be discussed today. We want the Privilege Motion to be discussed. Allow my colleagues to participate in the lebate.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: If it is taken for granted that nothing else the Prime Minister can say except * on the floor of the House, then alone this Privilege Motion can be rejected. It is the Prime Minister who has made a false statement.

THE MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI BUTA SINGH): It is an * it cannot be allowed to go on record. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Do not try to teach me. (*Interruptions*).

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF COMMERCE (SHRI P. R. DAS MUNSHI): You listen to her first. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: I have the right to say. You have got a lesson in Bengal. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You first go back to your seats. (*Interruptions*) I will look into the records and expunge the remarks. You go back to your seats. Both sides are making noise. Please sit down. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: I have submitted a notice of breach of privilege... Just listen to me first. I have submitted a notice of breach of privilege against the Prime Minister for deliberately making a false statement in this House regarding Bofors deal. Let it be taken up first. I have the right to say...Can it be taken for granted... Just listen to me first of all.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI (Madhya Pradesh): He must be heard.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: I must be heard.

SHRI BUTA SINGH: Madam Deputy Chairman...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: The Home Minister must be stopped. The Home Minister cannot have the prerogative. (*Interruptions*) I have not come here on your grace, mind you.

SHRI K. MOHANAN (Kerala): This is not a simple question of rules. This is something in which the Prime Minister is involved. It is a question of propriety. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: The Home Minister is creating misrule in the country.

SHRI BUTA SINGH: You must obey the rules. You have to go by rules.

---

*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Dont teach me the rules. I know the rules. You must not be allowed to speak.

SHRI BUTA SINGH: I have nothing to do with you. My submission is to the Chair.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: You will not be allowed to speak if I am not allowed to speak. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Privilege motion will be taken only according to rules and in the usual manner. You cannot just stand up on your seat and say it should be taken up first. This is a disorganised state of affairs... You listen to me. I have allowed you to make your submission. No breach of privilege will be allowed to be discussed unless it is admitted by the Chair.

...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA (Andhra Pradesh): We want to say why it should be admitted. We have a right to say.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The usual manner in which a breach of privilege is considered, you will have to follow that... (*Interruptions*)... You are not following the procedure and, therefore, you are not ready even to allow me to read the ruling which I wanted to give. I want to give my ruling in one sentence, that the Question Hour cannot be suspended. If you do not want to listen to me, how can I listen to you?

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: They did not allow... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Before you admit the motion, you have to hear us.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let me give my reaction to them. You just cannot go on talking and not allow the Chair. That is not the procedure of the House. You have to listen to the Chair. You can't just go on saying whatever you want to say, without the permission of the Chair and then rising in your seats and shouting. This cannot be permitted... (*Interruptions*)... You are not following the Rules of Procedure ...(*Interruptions*).

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: We don't question the Chair at all. But, before you admit, you have got to hear us why it should be admitted.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please listen, Mr. Gurupadaswamy. You are a very senior Member and, therefore, I request you that when the Chair permits, you speak. Even for moving the motion the Chair has to permit it.... (*Interruptions*)...Now you please listen. I have received three notices...(*Interruptions*)... I will explain the whole position.

...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: No, Madam Deputy Chairman. We must be heard.... (Interruptions) ..

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You are not allowing me to speak.. (*Interruptions*) ...All this time you were not listening to me.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Rule 190 provides for that.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I know that.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: I am not showing the rule...(*Interruptions*)... As the Chair would be heard, the Chair would also hear. That is the rule, first of all. I could not finish my sentence... (*Interruptions*)...The Minister of Home Affairs....

...(*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: About the motion to be moved, unless I permit you cannot ask. This is a very fundamental rule of procedure... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Please listen to me.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: All this time I was listening to you.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: You are only listening to the Minister. You are not listening to our points of order.

...(*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have been listening to both the sides. Rather,

mostly to you than the other side. Please don't say that... (*Interruptions*)... I want to know from which rule he is quoting.

SHRI NIRMAL CHATTERJEE (West Bengal): I am on a point of order.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Who wants to speak first--Mr. Ghosh or you? Please tell me.

SHRI NIRMAL CHATTERJEE: I want to make a submission.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Ghosh, please sit down. Yes, Mr. Chatterjee. Now, everybody, please listen. I will give a chance to everybody.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI M. M. JACOB): My humble submission is ...(*Interruptions*)... Let me say. Whatever is said from both the sides, expunge from the record, without the motion.....(*Interruptions*).....

SHRI NIRMAL CHATTERJEE: Madam, my point of order is..

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Which rule are you referring to?

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: I will quote.

SHRI NIRMAL CHATTERJEE : My point of order is: when the Question Hour was there, you indicated that why the Question Hour be suspended can only be mentioned and not the privilege motion as such. That is what you ruled. Therefore,.....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I ruled that the Question Hour cannot be suspended.

SHRI NIRMAL CHATERJEE: No, you said. It when you permitted Mr. Dipen Ghosh or Mr. Gurupadaswamy or Mr. Advani (*Interruptions*)

May I continue?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please let me know which rule you are referring to.

SHRI NIRMAL CHATTERJEE: May I be permitted, Madam? Madam, I submit, it was not in the form of a formal ruling, I agree. But you asserted, "You should not get into the substance of the motion on the question of privilege. But you just indicate why you want the Question Hour to be suspended." This is what you said. (*Interruptions*) Madam, the privilege notice has been given.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI (Maharashtra): He is wasting the time of the House.

SHRI NIRMAL CHATTERJEE: The issue is of such importance that the Question Hour should be suspended. Now the Question Hour is over without any ruling from you because you have not heard it.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: He is confusing everybody.

SHRI NIRMAL CHATTERJEE: We suggest that the movers of the privilege motion be allowed to make their submissions on the question of privilege so that the House is benefited to agree or to abide by your subsequent ruling.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: How can there be a point of order?

SHRI NIRMAL CHATTERJEE: My point of order is under rule 187.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Madam Deputy Chairman. I was allowed to show the rule. When I drew your attention....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What is the rule?

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH? I am quoting the rule. When I drew your attention to our notice of privilege... (*Interruptions*) I am quoting the rule. If I cannot quote the rule, then, you expel me from the House. But, you must hear me.

श्री घनश्याम सिंह : (उत्तर प्रदेश) ये गलत जगह से खड़े होकर बोल रहे है। यह अच्छी प्रक्रिया नहीं । ये अपनी सीट पर जाएं ।

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Now who is disturbing, tell me, Madam, which side is disturbing me.

DR. (SHRIMATI) NAJMA HEPTULLA (Maharashtra): He is not the Leader of the Opposition or of his party. How is he speaking from there? He should go back to his seat .

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Madam Deputy Chairman, you must rule the House. You cannot allow the House to be ruled by Mrs. Najma Heptulla, Maybe she was Deputy Chairman.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: She was not ruling. She has drawn my attention to the fact that you are not talking from your seat, which is correct. I request you first to go to your seat and then say whatever you want to say.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Shall I tell it? I know the rule. Mr. Secretary-General must be knowing that during the tenure of the last Chairman, when Mr. Samar Mukherjee became the leader of our group, it was arranged that in the absence of Mr. Samar Mukherjee I would take this seat and speak from here. This was allowed by the Chairman. But, if you say no, that you will not go by that order of the Chairman, I will go back to my seat, I will obey. (*Interruptions*) I again remind, Madam Deputy Chairman, that I was speaking from that with position with the permission given by the last Chairman, Mr. R. Venkataraman who is now the President of India. (*Interruptions*) My point is.....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Make your point only. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI PARAVATHANENI UPENDRA: It is very mean on their part to do this. And one day they have to come to this side. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Will you stop that now? The question is, when in the morning I drew your attention to our notice of privilege against the Prime Minister.... (*Interruptions*) Just look.

SHRI VITHALRAO MADHAVRAO JADHAV (Maharashtra): Madam, I am on a point of order.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Just look. You wanted me to quote the rule. I am quoting the rule and now they are creating untruly situations.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: (Madhya Pradesh): Since morning this is happening. They don't allow us to talk (*Interruptions*)

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: They want to gag us, but can they gag the people? (*Interruptions*)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Rule 190 (2), sub-rule 2 of Rule 190. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI B. SATYANARAYAN REDDY (Andhra Pradesh): Madam Deputy Chairman, this Government has no moral right to rule the country. The prime Minister must resign because corruption charges are there against him. (*Interruptions*) They have no moral right to rule the country on behalf of the people. So, they must be asked to withdraw from the Government and have fresh elections.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: First listen to me please. Now, there is a very important Calling Attention notice before the House. It is relating to communal incidents. Why do you while away the time of the House? It would not be good. Therefore, let us.... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: The Prime Minister is under cloud. That must be cleared first. (*Interruptions*) This cannot happen when the Prime Minister is under cloud. That must be cleared.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now we go back to our business.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Nothing can happen when the prime Minister is under cloud. It must be cleared first. The Prime Minister is accused of corruption.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now we take up Laying of papers on the Table. Secretary-General.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: You must listen to me first. Otherwise I will not allow. (*Interruptions*) Madam Deputy Chairman, you wanted me to quote the rules. I have quoted the

[Shri Dipen Ghosh]

rules—sub-rule 2 of Rule 190. Shall I read it or yo will give the ruling first? (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Kalmadi, please sit down. (*Interruptions*). Order please. (*Interruptions*) Please sit down. I am giving the ruling on his point of order. Don't you want a ruling on the point of order raised by you? So, please sit down. (*Interruptions*) You are not allowing me to give a ruling on a point of order. He has quoted Rule 190, sub-rule 2. I am giving a ruling.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: No, you have not heard me. Sub-rule 2..

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You want to make a speech under the pretext of point of order. That is not correct. How can you go on making a speech? You have to be very brief.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: I am not making a speech. You control them. How can you say I am making a speech?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am giving you permission to raise a point of order and you are not doing it. What can I do?

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: There is a question of giving a ruling under rule . . . (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He has raised a point of order under sub-section 2 of Rule 190. (*Interruptions*).

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY (Andhra Pradesh): You have not permitted me to raise a point of order yet; how do you want to give a ruling on it? You have not permitted me; yet you want to give a ruling, Where is the democracy in this country?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no, the ruling is not on your point of order because you have not raised any point or order. I am giving a ruling on his point of order.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Madam, it is not a point of order. You wanted to know under what rule I wanted to speak in connection with the notice of breach of privilege against the Prime Minister.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I never wanted to know that. (*Interruption*).

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Madam, I am reading out rule 190, section 2.

> "If objection to leave being garted is taken, the Chairman shall request those members, who are in favour of leave being granted to rise in their places and if not less than twenty-five members rise accordingly, the Chairman shall intimate that leave is granted. If less than twenty-five members rise, the Chairman shall inform the member that he has not the leave of the Council."
> (*Interruptions.*)

AN HON'BLE MEMBER: Madam, he cannot be permitted to say a word because it has not been admitted. (Interruptions)

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS (SHRI EDUARDO FALEIRO) : Madam Deputy Chairman, this cannot go on record. (*Interruptions.*)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: You ask us to write the names of 25 members, we will do that.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You cannot do that unless I permit the breach of privilege motion. That is against the rules. I cannot allow you to act against the rules. Now we go back to our business.